

Exchanges and Interactions in the Arts of Medieval Europe, Byzantium, and the Mediterranean

CONVIVIUM

Seminarium Kondakovianum
Series Nova



Université de Lausanne • Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic • Masaryk University

CONVIVIUM II/1/2015

**Exchanges and Interactions in the Arts of Medieval Europe, Byzantium, and the Mediterranean
Seminarium Kondakovianum Series Nova**

Journal of the Department of Art History of the University of Lausanne, of the Department of Art History of the Masaryk University, and of the Institute of Art History of the Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic

Editor-in-chief / Ivan Foletti

Executive editors / Karolina Foletti, Zuzana Frantová, Adrien Palladino, Pavla Tichá, Veronika Tvrzníková, Johanna Zacharias

Typesetting / Anna Kelblová, Monika Kučerová

Cover design / Petr M. Vronský

Publisher / Masarykova univerzita, Žerotínovo nám. 9, 601 77 Brno, IČ 00216224

Editorial Office / Seminář dějin umění, Filozofická fakulta Masarykovy univerzity, Arna Nováka 1, 602 00 Brno

E-mail / convivium@earlymedievalstudies.com

<http://www.earlymedievalstudies.com/convivium.html>

Print by / ASTRON studio CZ, a.s.; Green Park, Veselská 699, 199 00 Praha 9

Published / June 2015

Reg. No. MK ČR E 21592

ISSN 2336-3452

ISBN 978-80-210-7866-6

© Ústav dějin umění AV ČR, v. v. i. 2015

© Filozofická fakulta Masarykovy univerzity 2015

© Faculté des Lettres, Université de Lausanne 2015



Center for
Early Medieval Studies
West | Byzantium | Islam

COMMITTEES

Editors / Klára Benešová (Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic), Ivan Foletti (Université de Lausanne, Masaryk University, Brno), Herbert L. Kessler (Johns Hopkins University, Masaryk University, Brno), Serena Romano (Université de Lausanne), Elisabetta Scirocco (Bibliotheca Hertziana, Max-Planck-Institut für Kunstgeschichte)

Editor-in-chief / Ivan Foletti

Executive editors / Karolina Foletti, Zuzana Frantová, Adrien Palladino, Pavla Tichá, Veronika Tvrzníková, Johanna Zacharias

Editorial board / Michele Bacci (Université de Fribourg), Xavier Barral i Altet (Université de Rennes, Università di Venezia Ca' Foscari), Nicolas Bock (Université de Lausanne), Valentina Cantone (Università di Padova), Clario Di Fabio (Università di Genova), Ondřej Jakubec (Masaryk University, Brno), Xenia Muratova (Université de Rennes), Assaf Pinkus (Tel Aviv University), Jiří Roháček (Institute of Art History, Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic), Erik Thunø (Rutgers University), Alicia Walker (Bryn Mawr College)

II¹







Many Romes

Studies in Honor of Hans Belting

Edited by Ivan Foletti and Herbert L. Kessler

TABULA GRATULATORIA

Scholars

- AKIRA **AKIYAMA**, University of Tokyo
KIRK **AMBROSE**, University of Colorado Boulder
GIULIA **ARCIDIACONO**, Università degli Studi di Catania
MICHELE **BACCI**, Université de Fribourg
BARBARA **BAERT**, KU Leuven
ANTONELLA **BALLARDINI**, Università degli Studi Roma Tre
CHARLES **BARBER**, Princeton University
XAVIER **BARRAL I ALTET**, Université de Rennes 2/Università di Venezia Ca' Foscari
KLÁRA **BENEŠOVSKÁ**, Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic
GIOIA **BERTELLI**, Università degli Studi di Bari Aldo Moro
MARIA ALESSANDRA **BILOTTA**, Nova University of Lisbon
SIBLE L. **DE BLAAUW**, Radboud University Nijmegen
DIETER **BLUME**, Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena
ÁDÁM **BOLLÓK**, Hungarian Academy of Sciences
GIULIA **BORDI**, Università degli Studi Roma Tre
ANNA **BORECKZY**, Hungarian National Library
VALENTINA **CANTONE**, Università degli Studi di Padova
GUGLIELMO **CAVALLO**, Sapienza Università di Roma
PETER CORNELIUS **CLAUSSEN**, Universität Zürich
ADAM S. **COHEN**, University of Toronto
PHILIPPE **CORDEZ**, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München
REBECCA W. **CORRIE**, Bates College Lewiston
FABRIZIO **CRIVELLO**, Università di Torino
CHIARA **CROCI**, Université de Lausanne
BRANISLAV **CVETKOVIĆ**, Regional Museum of Jagodina
THOMAS **DALE**, University of Wisconsin Madison
MANUELA **DE GIORGI**, Università del Salento Lecce
FRANCESCA **DELL'ACQUA**, Università degli Studi di Salerno
NATHAN S. **DENNIS**, Johns Hopkins University
CLARIO **DI FABIO**, Università degli Studi di Genova
STEFANO **D'OVIDIO**, Università degli Studi di Napoli Federico II
ANNE **DUNLOP**, Tulane University New Orleans
DAGMAR **EICHBERGER**, Universität Trier
GÉZA **ÉRSZEGI**, Budapest
MARINA **FALLA CASTELFRANCHI**, Università del Salento Lecce
LAURA **FENELLI**, Florence
ALŽBĚTA **FILIPOVÁ**, Université de Lausanne/Masaryk University in Brno
CRISTIANA **FILIPPINI**, Trinity College in Rome/University of California, Rome Study Center
IVAN **FOLETTI**, Université de Lausanne/Masaryk University in Brno
EVA **FROJMOVIC**, University of Leeds
FRANCESCO **GANGEMI**, Bibliotheca Hertziana – Max-Planck-Institut für Kunstgeschichte
JEAN-PHILIPPE **GENET**, Université de Paris 1
LUDOVICO V. **GEYMONAT**, Bibliotheca Hertziana – Max-Planck-Institut für Kunstgeschichte
MANUELA **GIANANDREA**, Sapienza Università di Roma
VALENTINE **GIESSER**, Université de Lausanne
CARLO **GINZBURG**, Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa/UCLA
MICHAEL **GRÜNBART**, Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster
CYNTHIA **HAHN**, Hunter College New York
JANE **HAWKES**, University of York
HANS W. **HUBERT**, Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg
ANTONIO **IACOBINI**, Sapienza Università di Roma
ONDŘEJ **JAKUBEC**, Masaryk University in Brno
JELENA **JOVANOVIĆ**, Sapienza Università di Roma
RAINER **KAHSNITZ**, Akademie der Wissenschaften und der Literatur Mainz
LADISLAV **KESNER**, Masaryk University in Brno
HERBERT L. **KESSLER**, Johns Hopkins University/Masaryk University in Brno
BEATRICE **KITZINGER**, Stanford University
JAN **KLÍPA**, National Gallery in Prague
GUNTAM **KOCH**, Philipps-Universität Marburg
JEANETTE **KOHL**, University of California at Riverside
JIRÍ **KROUPA**, Masaryk University in Brno



BIANCA **KÜHNEL**, Hebrew University of Jerusalem
PETER **KURMANN** UND BRIGITTE **KURMANN-SCHWARZ**,
Pieterlen
GERALDINE **LEARDI**, Roma
BIRGITTA **LINDROS WOHL**, California State University
PETER **LOW**, Williams College Williamstown
VINNI **LUCHERINI**, Università degli Studi di Napoli
Federico II
MARIO **MARCENARO**, Genova
FRANCESCO **MARIANI**, Firenze
MARIELLE **MARTINIANI-REBER**, Musée d'art et d'histoire
de Genève
TANJA **MICHALSKY**, Bibliotheca Hertziana – Max-Planck-
-Institut für Kunstgeschichte
SUZUKI **MICHITAKA**, Okayama University
SIMONA **MORETTI**, ILMU International University
of Languages and Media
XENIA **MURATOVA**, Université de Rennes 2
ENRICA **NERI LUSANNA**, Firenze
ARIETTA **PAPACONSTANTINO**, University of Reading
SILVIA **PEDONE**, Koç University Istanbul
BISSERA **PENTCHEVA**, Stanford University
SIMONE **PIAZZA**, Université Paul-Valéry Montpellier 3
YONA **PINSON**, Tel Aviv University
IRENE **QUADRI**, Université de Lausanne
CHRYSSA **RANOUTSAKI**, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität
München
BRUNO **REUDENBACH**, Universität Hamburg
ANDREAS **RHOBY**, Österreichische Akademie der Wissen-
schaften Wien
SERENA **ROMANO**, Université de Lausanne
LINDA **SAFRAN**, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Stu-
dies Toronto
JEAN-CLAUDE **SCHMITT**, EHESS Paris
ELISABETTA **SCIROCCO**, Bibliotheca Hertziana
– Max-Planck-Institut für Kunstgeschichte
NANCY P. **ŠEVČENKO**, International Center of
Medieval Art

PIOTR **SKUBISZEWSKI**, University of Warsaw
JEAN-PIERRE **SODINI**, Académie des Inscriptions
et Belles-Lettres Paris
JEAN-MICHEL **SPIESER**, Université de Fribourg
CHRISTINE **STEPHAN-KAISSIS**, Ruprecht-Karls-Universität
Heidelberg
ALESSANDRO **TADDEI**, Sapienza Università di Roma
ERIK **THUNØ**, Rutgers University New Brunswick
SHIGEBUMI **TSUJI**, Osaka University
GIOVANNA **VALENZANO**, Università degli Studi di Padova
CATHERINE **VANDERHEYDE**, Université de Strasbourg/
Université libre de Bruxelles
LUCIA **VARGIU**, Università degli Studi di Cagliari
UTE **VERSTEGEN**, Philipps-Universität Marburg
GARY **VIKAN**, Baltimore
JACOB **WAMBERG**, Aarhus University
CHRISTOPH **WINTERER**, Johannes Gutenberg-Univer-
sität Mainz
JOHANNA **ZACHARIAS**, Adams
NINO **ZCHOMELIDSE**, Johns Hopkins University

Institutions

BIBLIOTECA DEL PONTIFICIO ISTITUTO ORIENTALE, Roma
CENTRO BIBLIOTECARIO ATENEIO, Università degli Studi
di Salerno, Salerno
DEPARTMENT OF ART HISTORY AND ARCHAEOLOGY,
Columbia University, New York
DIPARTIMENTO DEI BENI CULTURALI: ARCHEOLOGIA,
STORIA DELL'ARTE, DEL CINEMA E DELLA MUSICA,
Università degli Studi di Padova, Padova
DOMAINE D'HISTOIRE DE L'ART, Université de Fribourg,
Fribourg
KUNSTGESCHICHTLICHES INSTITUT, Philipps-Universität
Marburg, Marburg
KUNSTHISTORISCHES INSTITUT, Universität
Zürich, Zürich

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

Ivan Foletti & Herbert L. Kessler

- 13** **Hans Belting. A Bridge to Many Romes**

ARTICLES

Jean-Claude Schmitt

- 18** **Rome, Trier, Kiev**

Tanja Michalsky

- 38** ***Grata pictura* and *mapa duplex*. Paolino
Minorita's Late Medieval Map of Rome as an
Epistemological Instrument of a Historiographer**

Ivan Foletti

- 60** **Dio da dio: la maschera di Cristo, Giove Serapide
e il mosaico di Santa Pudenziana a Roma**

Dieter Blume

- 74** **Rom im Exil – Die fiktiven Räume des Matteo
Giovanetti in Avignon**

Simone Piazza

- 88** **Un *unicum* fra Oriente e Occidente: l'immagine
della Trasfigurazione in San Gabriele ad Airola,
Benevento**

Francesca Dell'Acqua

- 102** ***Porta coeli*: the Annunciation as Threshold
of Salvation**

Michele Bacci

- 126** **A Power of Relative Importance: San Marco
and the Holy Icons**

Shigebumi Tsuji

- 148** **The Starry Night. Art before the Era of the Icon**

- Ádám Bollók*
**166 Byzantium on the Theiss: of Byzantine Diplomacy,
the Emperor's Image and the Avars**
- Branislav Cvetković & Cynthia Hahn*
**182 Imperial Aspirations: Relics and Reliquaries
of the Byzantine Periphery**
- Jean-Michel Spieser*
**202 Le monastère du Pantocrator à Constantinople:
le typikon et le monument**
- Xavier Barral i Altet*
**218 Un programme iconographique occidental pour le
pavement médiéval de l'église du Christ Pantocrator
de Constantinople**
- Alessandro Taddei*
**234 A Neglected Mosaic in the South Gallery of Hagia
Sophia, Constantinople**
- Ondřej Jakubec*
**250 Roman References in Early Modern Central
European Confessional Architecture**
- Serena Romano*
268 Picasso e il vero volto dell'Arlecchino
- ABOUT HANS BELTING
- Collected by Alžběta Filipová, Adrien Palladino & Pavla Tichá*
280 Biography and Bibliography of Hans Belting
- 294 Photographic credits**

Hans Belting

A Bridge to Many Romes

Ivan Foletti & Herbert L. Kessler

Dedicating a special issue of *Convivium* to mark Hans Belting's eightieth birthday is an altogether natural gesture. Few scholars have contributed as profoundly as he has to the mandate articulated in the new journal's subtitle: "Exchanges and Interactions in the Arts of Medieval Europe, Byzantium, and the Mediterranean". Fewer still have realized the fledgling periodical's goal of extending art history into such allied fields as anthropology, literature, and history – from the Early Christian period to the sixteenth century. Even a cursory review of the bibliography printed at the end of this volume confirms the overlap between Hans Belting's prodigious production with *Convivium's* aspirations. His work covers the map encompassed by the journal, from the Caucasus to Constantinople to Italy, France, the Netherlands, and Germany; and, setting aside the contributions to modern art, photography, new media and theory, his proceeds along more or less the same development *Convivium* embraces – from the Justinianic period through the eighth and ninth centuries, into the High Middle Ages and beyond as far as the Reformation. Challenging many assumptions underlying the ways scholars consider the basic materials, furthermore, Hans Belting has extended a medievalist's sensibility to materiality, reception, and function and also to works produced by Jan van Eyck, Giovanni Bellini and Hieronymus Bosch, anticipating in this way *Convivium's* call to broaden the definition of the history of art and to examine "the genesis and life of art-historical studies" by attending to historiography as in his highly influential synthesis *Bild und Kult: Eine Geschichte des Bildes vor dem Zeitalter der Kunst*. Journal and scholar are a perfect fit.

Moreover, like *Convivium*, Hans Belting does not limit his purview to Europe. His revolutionary comparison of the reception of Alhazen's optical theories in Islam and Italy in *Florenz und Baghdad*, to cite the most important of many

examples, gives due weight to both Christian and Moslem cultures in a manner that provides a paradigm for understanding the very foundations of the methods art historians use for understanding the relationship of theoretic writings to artistic manifestations. And while Hans Belting probes the ways in which ideas are received differently, he also tracks the real exchanges that contributed to medieval art, the movement of materials, models, objects, and persons. Not surprising, he has been a leader in the new global art history.

A scholar who has consistently rejected all narrow definitions of the discipline of art history while applying the highest standards of research to each project he has undertaken, Hans Belting thus embodies *Convivium's* own aspirations; his enormous range of interests demonstrates the very possibility that the study of medieval art need not be balkanized into subspecialties, even as its methods rely increasingly on specialized knowledge and theoretical reach. His unlimited imagination and intelligence, which has prompted and inspired so many admirers to think and work in new modes – and to take risks – provides a model for this journal.

This special issue is not a *Festschrift*. Taking as its principle a theme that Hans Belting has considered in diverse aspects, it constitutes a modest but impassioned tribute to a great scholar who has been both a mirror for self-examination in the field and a beacon of promise for future study of medieval art history. Moreover, the question of “Many Romes” seemed to the editors not only to acknowledge Hans Belting’s innumerable and diverse contributions to the history of medieval art (and more than that as well) but also to be a fertile subject for further consideration within *Convivium's* mandate.

To judge from the preserved evidence, Rome was probably the nucleus of artistic production during the medieval millennium. Both models and ideas emanated from the Eternal City within the Mediterranean basin and throughout continental Europe; and, in a reverse process, like a sponge, the “*Urbs*” absorbed impulses flowing into it from the “*Orbis*”. How important Rome was might be understood through the heated debate about Late Antique art conducted more than a century ago by Alois Riegel and Josef Strzygowski. But one fact is certain: if not all roads, certainly many, led to the City, skirted it, crossed it, or emanated from it.

This volume of *Convivium* proceeds from this, to a certain extent, obvious observation with the goal of focusing on one of the crucial aspects of the myth of Rome, namely, the ways in which the imagined and physical characteristics were intentionally engaged to construct culture, power, and devotion throughout Europe and the Mediterranean. From Kiev to Avignon to Protestant Bohemia, to Assisi, and obviously to the Second Rome, Constantinople, the Eternal City became a model, explicit or implicit, for generations of artists and intellectuals. The name or simply the myth engendered associations that provided a first sketch of what was to become “Europe”. An example not treated in this volume but worth mentioning is the “Third Rome” of Moscow. Conceived in the sixteenth century and becoming a central concept in the nineteenth, it clarifies one major issue, namely, that the imaginary Rome – like the real one – was a bridge between diverse worlds and cultures. Referring to the ancient *Urbs*’s power, but also simply the awareness of it, became a means for constructing a stable if polymorphous space that was not only very real but also where the synthesis of numerous elements was an aspect of self-identity. In turn, this special issue of *Convivium* also treats how Rome assimilated stimuli and ideas from the East and northern Africa to construct itself as the capital of the world. It was not by chance that, in this dialogue, Rome absorbed at least as much as it inspired.

At the same time, the cultural interchanges at the center of this volume also serve as a potent metaphor for describing the role that Hans Belting has had in the study of art history and also for *Convivium* itself: a bridge between diverse worlds and consistently driven through dialogue. The hope is that the volume might become a vehicle for reflection on how the medieval worlds constructed themselves and interacted with one another in a reciprocal process as a way of paying tribute to one of the most significant scholars of medieval interchange, interaction, and dialogue. In the name of the editorial boards of *Convivium*, faithful to Central European traditions – themselves a world bridging worlds – it is a song of *Živijó* to Hans Belting in thanks for all he has given and continues to give to the history of art.

